



UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
United States Patent and Trademark Office
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
09/916,611	07/27/2001	Greg Volgas	HCC-011 (306*142)	8709
23416	7590	11/19/2003	EXAMINER	
CONNOLLY BOVE LODGE & HUTZ, LLP			PRYOR, ALTON NATHANIEL	
P O BOX 2207			ART UNIT	
WILMINGTON, DE 19899			PAPER NUMBER	

1616

DATE MAILED: 11/19/2003

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

Office Action Summary

Application No.

09/916,611

Applicant(s)

VOLGAS ET AL.

Examiner

Alton N. Pryor

Art Unit

1616

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --
Period for Reply

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If the period for reply specified above is less than thirty (30) days, a reply within the statutory minimum of thirty (30) days will be considered timely.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133).
- Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

Status

- 1) ☐ Responsive to communication(s) filed on 03 August 2003.
- 2a) ☒ This action is FINAL. 2b) ☐ This action is non-final.
- 3) ☐ Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

Disposition of Claims

- 4) ☐ Claim(s) 1-91 is/are pending in the application.
- 4a) Of the above claim(s) See Continuation Sheet is/are withdrawn from consideration.
- 5) ☐ Claim(s) _____ is/are allowed.
- 6) ☐ Claim(s) 1,2,8,9,12,18,19,28,29,33,37-40,44-49,53,66,69,72,74-81 and 86-90 is/are rejected.
- 7) ☐ Claim(s) _____ is/are objected to.
- 8) ☐ Claim(s) _____ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

Application Papers

- 9) ☐ The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
- 10) ☐ The drawing(s) filed on _____ is/are: a) ☐ accepted or b) ☐ objected to by the Examiner.
Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).
Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).
- 11) ☐ The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.

Priority under 35 U.S.C. §§ 119 and 120

- 12) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
a) ☐ All b) ☐ Some * c) ☐ None of:
1. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
2. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. _____.
3. ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).
* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.
- 13) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for domestic priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(e) (to a provisional application) since a specific reference was included in the first sentence of the specification or in an Application Data Sheet. 37 CFR 1.78.
a) ☐ The translation of the foreign language provisional application has been received.
- 14) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for domestic priority under 35 U.S.C. §§ 120 and/or 121 since a specific reference was included in the first sentence of the specification or in an Application Data Sheet. 37 CFR 1.78.

Attachment(s)

- 1) ☐ Notice of References Cited (PTO-892) 4) ☐ Interview Summary (PTO-413) Paper No(s). _____
- 2) ☐ Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948) 5) ☐ Notice of Informal Patent Application (PTO-152)
- 3) ☐ Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO-1449) Paper No(s) _____ 6) ☐ Other: _____

Continuation of Disposition of Claims: Claims withdrawn from consideration are 3-7,10,11,13-17,20-27,30-32,34-36,41-43,50-52,54-65,67,68,70,71,73,82-85 and 91.

DETAILED ACTION

Response to Amendment

Applicant's arguments filed have been fully considered but they are not persuasive.

I. Rejection of claims 1,2,8,9,12,18,19,28,29,33,37-40,44-49,53,66,69,72,74-81,86-90 under 35 USC 103(a) as being obvious over Berger and Cadwell on record will be maintained for reasons on record and reasons as follows.

Applicant argues that Berger teaches that herbicides such as chlorinated carboxylic acid herbicides are usually reacted into the form of an amine or another salt and then placed in an environment to breakdown into the active acid form. Examiner argues that Berger does not teach solely on the use of chlorinated carboxylic acid herbicides in the salt form, but rather teaches that the chlorinated carboxylic acid herbicides are usually employed in salt form. Examiner interprets the term usually as meaning in most cases rather than in all cases. Therefore, the Examiner deduces that there are instances in which Berger may find it useful to make a composition comprising 2,4-D (a chlorinated carboxylic acid herbicide) as a free acid.

Applicant argues that Cadwell's toxicology report for 2,4-D in free acid form is not surprising. Applicant argues that 2,4-D acid is the initial form in which the herbicide was discovered. Applicant argues that commercial formations have always been made from ester or amine salt of 2,4-D. Applicant argues that it is less likely that an artisan would combine a toxicology report on the free acid of 2,4-D and Berger's patent on 2,4-D salts.

Art Unit: 1616

Applicant argues that obviousness can not be established by combining the prior art on record absent some teaching, suggestion, or incentive supporting the combination.

Examiner takes the view that Cadwell teaches a herbicidal composition wherein 2,4-D is in free acid form. Examiner argues that there exist ample motivation for combining the prior art references of record since references individually teach herbicidal compositions.

THIS ACTION IS MADE FINAL. Applicant is reminded of the extension of time policy as set forth in 37 CFR 1.136(a).

A shortened statutory period for reply to this final action is set to expire **THREE MONTHS** from the mailing date of this action. In the event a first reply is filed within **TWO MONTHS** of the mailing date of this final action and the advisory action is not mailed until after the end of the **THREE-MONTH** shortened statutory period, then the shortened statutory period will expire on the date the advisory action is mailed, and any extension fee pursuant to 37 CFR 1.136(a) will be calculated from the mailing date of the advisory action. In no event, however, will the statutory period for reply expire later than **SIX MONTHS** from the mailing date of this final action.


Telephonic Inquiry

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Alton N. Pryor whose telephone number is 703 308-4691. The examiner can normally be reached on 8:00 a.m. - 4:30 p.m..

Art Unit: 1616

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Thurman Page can be reached on 703-308-2927. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 703 305-3592.

Any inquiry of a general nature or relating to the status of this application or proceeding should be directed to the receptionist whose telephone number is 703 308-1235.


ALTON N. PRYOR
PRIMARY EXAMINER
Alton Pryor
Primary Examiner
AU 1616